JUDGE ROBERT S. LASNIK

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON AT SEATTLE

WASHINGTON TOXICS COALITION and PEOPLE FOR PUGET SOUND, non-profit corporations,

NO.CV04-2040 RSL

Plaintiffs,

CONSENT DECREE

v.

VALORIA H. LOVELAND, in her capacity as the Director of the Washington State Department of Agriculture; and the WASHINGTON STATE DEPARTMENT OF AGRICULTURE, an agency of the State of Washington,

Defendants.

I. RECITALS

WHEREAS the Washington State Department of Ecology (hereinafter "WSDOE") issued coverage under an Aquatic Noxious Weed Control National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System Waste Discharge General Permit (hereinafter "the General Permit") to the Washington State Department of Agriculture (hereinafter "WSDA") on May 15, 2002;

WHEREAS the purpose of the General Permit is to regulate the application of aquatic herbicides for the control of noxious and quarantine weeds in compliance with section 402 of

Case 2:04-cv-02040-RSL Document 18 Filed 09/06/05 Page 2 of 18

the Clean Water Act (33 U.S.C. § 1342), and Washington state laws implementing the Clean

Water Act (chapter 90.48 RCW; chapter 173-226 WAC);

WHEREAS the General Permit by its terms covers all noxious and quarantine weed

control activities that discharge herbicides directly into surface waters anywhere in the state

of Washington.

WHEREAS WSDOE issued coverage under the General Permit to WSDA intending

that WSDA extend "umbrella coverage" for cooperators undertaking herbicide treatments to

control noxious and quarantine weeds;

WHEREAS WSDA administered the General Permit consistent with WSDOE's

intent, conducted all planning and monitoring activities required under the General Permit

and has submitted all reports required under the General Permit;

WHEREAS the Washington Toxics Coalition and People for Puget Sound

(hereinafter "the Plaintiffs"), in July 2004, filed notices of intent to sue WSDA under the

citizen suit provision of the Clean Water Act, 33 U.S.C. § 1365;

WHEREAS the Plaintiffs filed a complaint against WSDA and its Director on

September 28, 2004, alleging repeated and ongoing violations of Sections 301(a) and 402 of

the Clean Water Act (33 U.S.C. §§ 1311(a) and 1342), and the terms and conditions of the

General Permit;

WHEREAS WSDA and its Director filed an answer on October 28, 2004, contesting

the Plaintiffs' allegations;

WHEREAS the Plaintiffs and WSDA have engaged in ongoing settlement

discussions over the course of several months;

WHEREAS WSDA, without admitting any violations of the Clean Water Act or state

law, has agreed to certain changes in its interpretation and administration of the General

Permit, as set forth in this Decree;

CONSENT DECREE - 2 CASE NO. CV04-2040 RSL ATTORNEY GENERAL OF WASHINGTON Agriculture & Health Division 2425 Bristol Court SW

PO Box 40109 Olympia, WA 98504-0109 (360) 586-6500 WHEREAS WSDOE has agreed to undertake certain actions to develop a new

NPDES general permit covering the use of herbicides to control or eradicate noxious and

quarantine weeds in lakes, and has already begun those actions;

WHEREAS WSDA has agreed to pay reasonable attorney's fees and costs to the

Plaintiffs in the amount set forth in this Decree;

WHEREAS the parties now agree that settlement of this matter is in the public

interest and in the best interests of the parties and that entry of this Consent Decree without

litigation is the most appropriate means of resolving this matter and avoiding protracted

litigation costs and expenses;

WHEREAS the parties, by their respective attorneys, consent to the entry of this

Decree without trial or adjudication of any issue of fact or law by any party, other than

subsequent enforcement of this Consent Decree;

NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED

as follows:

II. JURISDICTION AND VENUE

1. This Court has jurisdiction under section 505(a) of the Clean Water Act (33)

U.S.C. § 1365(a)).

2. Venue is proper in the Western District of Washington under 33 U.S.C.

§ 1365(c).

III. APPLICABILITY OF DECREE

3. The provisions of this Decree shall apply to and be binding on all parties and

on their agents, officers, directors, trustees, employees, successors, assigns, and all persons,

firms, and corporations acting under the control or direction of a party. A change in the

organizational form or status of a party shall have no effect on that party's obligations under

this Decree.

CONSENT DECREE - 3 CASE NO. CV04-2040 RSL ATTORNEY GENERAL OF WASHINGTON Agriculture & Health Division 2425 Bristol Court SW PO Box 40109

Olympia, WA 98504-0109

IV. DEFINITIONS

4. The following definitions apply in this Consent Decree:

A. "Date of this Consent Decree" means the date that a final Consent

Decree is entered by the Court.

B. "General Permit" means the Aquatic Noxious Weed Control National

Pollutant Discharge Elimination System Waste Discharge General Permit; WSDA's

coverage under the General Permit was authorized by the Washington State

Department of Ecology on May 15, 2002.

C. "WSDA" means the Washington State Department of Agriculture and

the Director of that agency.

D. "WSDOE" means the Washington State Department of Ecology.

E. "Noxious weeds," as defined in the General Permit, means "those

species of plants listed as noxious Classes A, B, and C by the Washington State

Noxious Weed Control Board in accordance with 17.10 RCW."

F. "Quarantine weeds," as that term is used in the General Permit, means

those species included on the "quarantine list [that] is maintained by the Washington

State Department of Agriculture (WSDA) in accordance with 17.24 RCW."

G. "Applicant" means a county noxious weed control board established

under chapter 17.10 RCW, or any other government agency or officer authorized by

law to carry out activities to control or eradicate noxious weeds or quarantine weeds.

"Applicant" also means a non-governmental entity, which may include a commercial

pesticide applicator, that is planning to carry out activities to control or eradicate

noxious weeds or quarantine weeds in cooperation with or as part of a specific

program that is coordinated, operated, or funded by WSDA.

H. "Existing noxious weed control program" means a program to control

and/or eradicate noxious weeds and/or quarantine weeds that was authorized by law

and in effect on the date the General Permit was issued by WSDOE. A program

continues to be an "existing noxious weed control program" even though it may

receive new authorities and duties over time related to the control and/or eradication

of noxious weeds or quarantine weeds. A program does not lose its status as an

"existing noxious weed control program" because of the program's periodic

inactivity, so long as the program itself remains in existence and the legal authority

for the program continues.

I. "Extension of coverage" or "extending coverage" or any variant of

these phrases means a contractual relationship between WSDA and an Applicant,

under which the Applicant becomes WSDA's contractual agent for the sole purpose

of acting under the General Permit for noxious or quarantine weed control and/or

eradication activities specified in the contract in exchange for agreeing to be bound

by applicable terms and conditions in the General Permit. The phrases do not mean

or imply that WSDA is issuing a permit to an Applicant.

V. INTERPRETATION OF THE GENERAL PERMIT

WSDA may continue to operate and coordinate programs to control or

eradicate quarantine weeds and introduced *Spartina* species, knotweed, purple loosestrife,

and other noxious weeds for which WSDA has statutory authority or funding. WSDA may

contract with local weed boards and other governmental entities with existing noxious weed

control programs to undertake activities involving the use of herbicides to control or

eradicate these species. WSDA also may contract with other Applicants, including

commercial pesticide applicators, who are undertaking activities involving the use of

herbicides to control or eradicate these species in cooperation with or as part of a specific

program that is coordinated, operated, or funded by WSDA. WSDA shall not contract with

commercial pesticide applicators or with non-governmental organizations that are not acting

CONSENT DECREE - 5 CASE NO. CV04-2040 RSL

5.

Case 2:04-cv-02040-RSL Document 18 Filed 09/06/05 Page 6 of 18

in cooperation with or as part of a specific program that is coordinated, operated, or funded

by WSDA.

6. WSDA may contract with local weed boards and other governmental entities

with existing noxious weed control programs to undertake or arrange for activities involving

the use of herbicides to control or eradicate noxious weeds or quarantine weeds within the

jurisdiction of the local weed board or other governmental entity, even though the particular

control or eradication program is not coordinated, operated, or funded by WSDA. WSDA

shall not contract with commercial pesticide applicators or with private organizations to

undertake activities involving the use of herbicides to control or eradicate noxious weeds or

quarantine weeds, except as provided in paragraph 5 of this Decree. However, nothing in

this Consent Decree shall be construed to prevent local weed boards and other governmental

entities with whom WSDA contracts under this paragraph from separately contracting with

commercial pesticide applicators to carry out activities to control noxious weeds or

quarantine weeds authorized under the contract between WSDA and the governmental entity.

7. Each contract WSDA enters into under paragraph 5 or paragraph 6 of this

Decree shall provide that the Applicant is made an agent of WSDA for the purpose of

ensuring compliance with the requirements of the General Permit and with applicable state

and federal laws; PROVIDED, however, that the agency relationship shall not extend beyond

that purpose as set forth in the contracting document(s) unless specifically negotiated and

agreed to by WSDA. If a qualified Applicant accepts this agency relationship and agrees to

assume specific obligations to ensure compliance with the requirements of the General

Permit and with applicable state and federal laws, and if WSDA determines the activities to

control or eradicate noxious weeds or quarantine weeds proposed by the Applicant fall within

the coverage of the General Permit, WSDA may extend coverage under the General Permit

to those activities.

CONSENT DECREE - 6 CASE NO. CV04-2040 RSL

(360) 586-6500

8. As the permittee under the General Permit, WSDA shall comply fully with all

applicable terms and conditions of the General Permit. Nothing in this Consent Decree shall

be construed to relieve WSDA of any obligation under the General Permit.

9. In each instance in which WSDA contractually extends its coverage under the

General Permit to an Applicant proposing activities to control or eradicate noxious weeds or

quarantine weeds, WSDA shall include provisions designed to ensure that its agents thus

created comply with the terms and conditions of the General Permit.

10. Each contract extending coverage under the General Permit may provide such

coverage only for one growing season. No such contract may extend coverage beyond

December 31 of the year in which the contracting document(s) were agreed to and signed.

11. Each contract extending coverage under the General Permit shall require the

Applicant to enter into the following specific agreements as a condition that must be accepted

before WSDA may contractually extend coverage to the activities proposed by the Applicant:

A. An Applicant must agree specifically to comply with all provisions in

Section S1 of the General Permit, including all specific limitations for lakes. In

addition, an Applicant treating aquatic noxious weeds in a lake must specifically

agree that, if it is notified by WSDA or otherwise learns that the waterbody to be

treated contains a rare or endangered plant species, the Applicant will consult with the

Washington Department of Natural Resources prior to treatment to minimize or avoid

negative impacts on rare or endangered plants and provide written confirmation to

WSDA that it has so consulted.

B. An Applicant must agree specifically to comply with the monitoring

requirements in Sections S2 and S3 of the General Permit, as appropriate.

C. The Applicant must specifically agree to provide the following

information to WSDA for each treatment that occurs within seven working days of

completing the treatment:

CONSENT DECREE - 7 CASE NO. CV04-2040 RSL (1) The common name of the waterbody that was treated.

(2) The Water Resource Inventory Area (WRIA) number for the

waterbody that was treated.

(3) The species name of the target weed(s).

(4) The name of the herbicide or herbicides that were to be used

and the EPA registration number for each herbicide.

(5) The actual amount of herbicide (gallons or pounds) used to

treat the target weeds at that waterbody.

(6) The actual date(s) on which treatment was made.

(7) The actual number of acres that were treated.

Where a waterbody is being treated comprehensively over the course of a season,

WSDA may require periodic reporting of the information required in this

subparagraph, on a weekly or monthly basis as appropriate.

D. An Applicant who is not a part of the annual monitoring plan

(described as Option 1 is Section S2.A of the General Permit) must agree specifically

to maintain records of all information required in Section S3.D of the General Permit

for at least five years.

E. An Applicant must specifically agree to immediately notify WSDA

and to immediately stop, contain, and clean up any unauthorized discharge or other

activity that violates any of the terms, conditions, and requirements in the General

Permit or in the contract between WSDA and the Applicant.

F. An Applicant must specifically agree that all treatment activities will

be consistent with the applicable integrated pest management plan or the applicable

integrated aquatic vegetation management plan. An Applicant also must specifically

agree to provide copies of any and all such plans to each commercial pesticide

applicator acting on the Applicant's behalf to control aquatic noxious and quarantine

CONSENT DECREE - 8 CASE NO. CV04-2040 RSL ATTORNEY GENERAL OF WASHINGTON Agriculture & Health Division 2425 Bristol Court SW

2425 Bristol Court SW PO Box 40109 Olympia, WA 98504-0109 (360) 586-6500 weeds in Washington before treatment begins, and to provide copies of such plans to

WSDA if requested by WSDA.

G. An Applicant must specifically agree that all treatments shall comply

with all pesticide label instructions, all applicable conditions imposed in the General

Permit, and all applicable state and federal laws, and with all terms, conditions, and

requirements imposed in the contract extending coverage under the General Permit.

H. An Applicant proposing to treat *Spartina* must specifically agree to

comply with the requirements imposed in Section S6.A.1 through S6.A.8 of the

General Permit.

I. An Applicant proposing to treat aquatic noxious or quarantine weeds

in a lake must specifically agree to comply with the requirements imposed in Section

S6.B of the General Permit.

J. An Applicant proposing to treat Spartina must specifically agree to

cooperate with WSDA in complying with the notice requirements in Sections P1.A,

P2, and P3.A of the General Permit. All other Applicants must specifically agree to

provide notice to affected residences and businesses in compliance with all applicable

terms, conditions, and requirements in Sections P1.B and P1.C of the General Permit,

and to post notice in compliance with Sections P3.B and P3.C of the General Permit.

K. An Applicant must specifically agree to ensure that all facilities or

systems of control are operated properly to achieve compliance with the terms,

conditions, and requirements of this Application for Coverage and of the General

Permit, as required in Section G2 of the General Permit.

L. An Applicant must specifically agree to allow authorized

representatives of WSDA, upon presenting proper identification, to enter any property

under the control of the Applicant, or under the control of any person or entity acting

CONSENT DECREE - 9 CASE NO. CV04-2040 RSL on the Applicant's behalf to control or eradicate aquatic noxious or quarantine weeds

in Washington, at reasonable times for the following purposes:

(1) To conduct any sampling, inspection, or monitoring required

under the General Permit or the contract extending coverage under the

General Permit;

(2) To gain access to and make copies of any records required to

be kept under the General Permit or the contract extending coverage under the

General Permit.

12. Each contract extending coverage under the General Permit shall require the

Applicant to enter into a new contract with WSDA if there is any change in the identity of the

Applicant, location of treatment, target weed(s), or herbicide(s) used, or an increase above

the herbicide amount(s) listed in an existing contract extending coverage under the General

Permit.

13. WSDA may unilaterally revoke a contract extending coverage under the

General Permit if WSDA reasonably finds any of the following:

A. That the Applicant, or a person or entity acting on the Applicant's

behalf to control or eradicate aquatic noxious or quarantine weeds in Washington, has

violated a term, condition, or requirement of the General Permit or the contract

extending coverage under the General Permit.

B. That the contract extending coverage under the General Permit was

obtained by misrepresentation or a failure to disclose fully all relevant facts to

WSDA.

C. That the Applicant, or a person or entity acting on the Applicant's

behalf to control or eradicate aquatic noxious or quarantine weeds in Washington, has

refused or failed to allow reasonable entry for the purposes specified in paragraph

10.M, above.

CONSENT DECREE - 10 CASE NO. CV04-2040 RSL ATTORNEY GENERAL OF WASHINGTON Agriculture & Health Division 2425 Bristol Court SW D. That the Applicant, or a person or entity acting on the Applicant's

behalf to control or eradicate aquatic noxious or quarantine weeds in Washington, has

violated applicable state or federal law.

E. That activities described in the contract extending coverage under the

General Permit are endangering human health or the environment, or significantly

contribute to water quality violations.

14. WSDA shall include any terms and conditions in a contract extending

coverage under the General Permit that WSDA determines are necessary and appropriate to:

A. Ensure that each Applicant assumes legal responsibility for complying

with all the terms, conditions, and requirements in the contract and the applicable

terms, conditions, and requirements in the General Permit;

B. Ensure that the WSDA and the state of Washington are indemnified

and held harmless by an Applicant for any and all liabilities arising from the

Applicant's noncompliance with the terms, conditions, and requirements in the

contract and the applicable terms, conditions, and requirements in the General Permit;

and

C. Ensure the legal effectiveness and enforceability of the contract.

15. Beginning on the effective date of this Consent Decree, WSDA will not enter

into any contract to extend coverage under the General Permit to any person or entity except

as provided in this Consent Decree.

VI. PUBLIC ACCESS TO INFORMATION

16. WSDA shall maintain a current list of persons and entities who have

submitted applications to enter into contracts for the extension of coverage under the General

Permit during each calendar year the General Permit is in effect. The list shall include the

following information:

- A. The name and address of the person or entity submitting the application.
- B. The name and address of the pesticide applicator or applicators who will be conducting the proposed treatment activities.
 - C. The name of the waterbody in which the treatment is proposed.
- D. The Water Resource Inventory Area (WRIA) number for the waterbody in which the treatment is proposed.
 - E. The type of noxious or quarantine weeds to be treated.
 - F. The species name(s) of the noxious or quarantine weeds to be treated
- G. The name of each herbicide to be used and its EPA registration number.
 - H. The amount of each herbicide (gallons or pounds) to be used.
 - I. The area in acres that is proposed for treatment.
 - J. The date(s) the proposed treatments will occur.
- K. A notation indicating whether WSDA responded to this application by (1) entering into a contract to extend coverage, or (2) denying the request to enter into a contract to extend coverage.
- 17. As WSDA receives the information required under paragraph 11.C, above, WSDA shall add the following information to the list described in paragraph 16, above:
 - A. The actual amount of each herbicide (gallons or pounds) that was used to treat the target weeds at that waterbody.
 - B. The actual number of acres that were treated.
 - C. The actual date(s) on which treatment was made.
- 18. WSDA shall ensure that the list described in paragraphs 16 and 17 of this Consent Decree is publicly available and readily accessible to the public. WSDA may satisfy this requirement by maintaining a current electronic copy of the list on its Internet site. If

WSDA elects not to maintain a current electronic copy of the list on its Internet site, it must

send an electronic or paper copy of the list upon request within two working days of

receiving the request.

19. WSDA shall send to any person, upon request and within five working days of

receiving a request, a copy of any monitoring results received or obtained for any treatment

performed during the current treatment season. Once the report required under Section S3A

of the General Permit is submitted to WSDOE, the monitoring results shall be available in

accordance with chapter 42.17 RCW and any other applicable state law.

20. WSDA shall provide a copy of the contract documents for any application to

any person requesting such a copy as quickly as possible, consistent with the Washington

Public Disclosure Act, chapter 42.17 RCW.

VII. DOCUMENTATION

21. WSDA shall forward to the Plaintiffs copies of all documents transmitted

between WSDA and WSDOE that relate to WSDA's compliance with the requirements of

the General Permit, and copies of written findings made by or transmitted to the Pest

Program of WSDA under paragraph 13 of this Consent Decree, from the effective date of this

Consent Decree until its termination. Copies of such documents shall be forwarded to the

Plaintiffs by the fifteenth day of the month following the calendar quarter in which they are

transmitted to WSDOE. All copies of documents to be forwarded to the Plaintiffs under this

Consent Decree shall be sent by first class mail to Washington Toxics Coalition, Attn: Erika

Schreder, 4649 Sunnyside Ave. N., Suite 540, Seattle, WA 98103.

VIII. MUTUAL COOPERATION

22. As part of the settlement that forms the basis of this Consent Decree, the

parties agree to continue to cooperate with each other in resolving any problems that may

arise, and to maintain good faith efforts to fully achieve all elements of this Consent Decree.

As part of this good faith effort, the parties agree as follows:

CONSENT DECREE - 13 CASE NO. CV04-2040 RSL A. Before pressing any other legal claim against WSDA arising from the

General Permit or this Consent Decree, the Plaintiffs agree to notify WSDA of any

apparent violations of the General Permit, of any contract extending coverage under

the General Permit, or of this Consent Decree and to give WSDA a reasonable

opportunity to correct any such violation.

B. WSDA agrees to work diligently to ensure compliance with the

General Permit by enforcing each contract extending coverage under the General

Permit, by complying in good faith with all provisions of the General Permit and this

Consent Decree, and by timely responding to any alleged violations noted by the

Plaintiffs.

C. The Plaintiffs agree to participate in WSDOE's development and

issuance of a new NPDES general permit covering the use of herbicides to control or

eradicate noxious and quarantine weeds in lakes to the extent permitted by law.

D. WSDA agrees to continue its active support for WSDOE's

development and issuance of a new NPDES general permit covering the use of

herbicides to control or eradicate noxious and quarantine weeds in lakes.

E. The parties agree to advocate for and otherwise support timely renewal

of this General Permit according to the schedule set by WSDOE.

23. If for any reason, the Court should decline to approve this Consent Decree in

the form presented, this Consent Decree and the settlement embodied herein shall be

voidable at the sole discretion of either party. The parties agree to continue negotiations in

good faith in an attempt to cure any objection raised by the Court to the entry of this Consent

Decree.

IX. COMPLIANCE WITH OTHER LAWS

24. This Consent Decree is not a permit and does not confer any authority on

WSDA that is not otherwise granted in law or authorized by the General Permit.

25. This Consent Decree shall not be construed as modifying the General Permit, nor shall it be construed as relieving WSDA from its obligations under any applicable federal or state law.

X. EFFECT OF CONSENT DECREE

- 26. The parties agree that this Consent Decree resolves all legal disputes at issue in this matter.
- 27. Each party reserves all legal and equitable remedies available to enforce the provisions of this Consent Decree.
 - 28. This Consent Decree is determined to be in the public interest.

XI. MODIFICATION OF CONSENT DECREE

29. This Consent Decree may be modified only upon written consent of the parties and the approval of the Court.

XII. EFFECTIVE DATE OF CONSENT DECREE

- 30. This Consent Decree shall take effect on the date it is entered by the Court.
- 31. The parties recognize that no consent judgment can be entered in a Clean Water Act suit in which the United States is not a party prior to forty-five (45) days following the receipt of a copy of the proposed consent judgment by the U.S. Attorney General and the Administrator of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency pursuant to 33 U.S.C. § 1365(c)(3). Therefore, upon the signing of this Consent Decree by the parties, Plaintiffs shall serve copies of the Consent Decree upon the U.S. Attorney General and the Administrator of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency.

XIII. TERMINATION OF CONSENT DECREE

32. The parties intend that this Consent Decree terminate on the date WSDOE issues one or more new National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System Waste Discharge general permits that (1) address the control of aquatic noxious weeds and quarantine weeds; (2) replace or renew the existing Aquatic Noxious Weed Control National Pollutant

Discharge Elimination System Waste Discharge General Permit issued by the Washington

State Department of Ecology to the Washington State Department of Agriculture on May 15,

2002; and (3) render the existing General Permit ineffective. The parties shall notify the

Court in the event such a replacement or renewal permit is issued.

33. In the event such a replacement or renewal permit is not issued by WSDOE by

December 31, 2008, this Consent Decree shall terminate on that date without any need for

further action by the Court. This Consent Decree shall not terminate prior to December 31,

2008, except by order of this Court.

34. If changes in governing law warrant termination of this Consent Decree, it

may be terminated by the Court, either upon its own motion or upon application by the

parties.

XIV. DISPUTE RESOLUTION

35. If a dispute arises between the parties regarding the implementation or

interpretation of this Consent Decree, the parties shall attempt to resolve the dispute by

informal negotiation. A dispute shall be considered to have arisen when any party notifies

the others in writing that there is a dispute, after which the parties shall attempt to resolve the

dispute informally for a period of thirty (30) days from the date of the notice with the goal of

resolving the dispute in good faith, without further proceedings. The period for informal

negotiations shall not exceed thirty (30) days unless the parties otherwise agree in writing to

extend that period.

36. If, at the end of the period provided in paragraph 35 or such other time as the

partied agree to in writing, the parties' attempt to informally negotiate a resolution of a

dispute is unsuccessful, any party may file a motion with the Court to obtain resolution of the

dispute. The motion shall contain a written statement of the movant's position on the matter

in dispute, including any supporting factual data, analysis, opinion, or documentation, and

shall set forth the relief requested and any schedule within which the dispute must be

CONSENT DECREE - 16 CASE NO. CV04-2040 RSL resolved for orderly implementation of the Consent Decree. Any party may request an

evidentiary hearing for good cause.

37. The filing of a petition asking the Court to resolve a dispute shall not of itself

extend or postpone any obligation imposed by the General Permit, by a contract extending

coverage under the General Permit, or by this Consent Decree.

XV. **CIVIL PENALTIES**

38. The parties agree that no civil penalties should be assessed against WSDA for

any violations of the General Permit alleged in the Complaint filed in this matter on

September 28, 2004.

XVI. COSTS OF SUIT

39. The parties agree that WSDA shall pay Plaintiffs' reasonable attorney fees

and costs in the aggregate and total amount of \$50,000.00 and that this payment shall

constitute full and complete payment of all costs and fees incurred by Plaintiffs in this matter.

This payment shall be due and payable thirty (30) days after the effective date of this Consent

Decree.

XVII. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

40. The Court shall retain jurisdiction to enforce the terms of this Consent Decree

and to resolve any disputes arising hereunder until the Consent Decree has been terminated in

accordance with Section XIII, above.

41. Nothing in this Consent Decree shall be construed to limit a party's right to

seek immediate relief from the Court if that party believes such relief is warranted.

XVIII. SEVERABILITY

42. The provisions of this Consent Decree shall be severable. Should any

provision be declared by a court of competent jurisdiction to be unenforceable, the remaining

provisions shall remain in full force and effect.

XIX. SIGNATORIES

43. The undersigned representative of each party to this Decree certifies that he or she is fully authorized by the party he or she represents to enter into the terms and conditions of this Decree and to legally execute and bind such party to this Decree.

DATED this 29th day of June, 2005.

SMITH & LOWNEY, PLLC

ROB McKENNA ATTORNEY GENERAL OF WASHINGTON

s/Richard A. Smith

Richard A. Smith, WSBA No. 21788 2317 East John Street Seattle, Washington 98112 (206) 860-2883

Attorneys for Washington Toxics Coalition and People for Puget Sound

s/Alan D. Copsey

Alan D. Copsey, WSBA No. 23305 Jacqueline Brown Miller, WSBA No. 28130 Assistant Attorneys General 2425 Bristol Court SW PO Box 40109 Olympia, WA 98504-0109 (360) 664-4967

Attorneys for Director Loveland and the Washington State Department of Agriculture

ORDER

IT IS SO ORDERED.

DATED this 6th day of September, 2005.

Robert S. Lasnik

United States District Judge

MMS Casnik